



# Staff Report

## Administration – Human Resources

---

**Report To:** COW\_Finance\_Admin\_Fire\_Community\_Services  
**Meeting Date:** April 29, 2024  
**Report Number:** FAF.24.065  
**Title:** Market and Pay Equity Review for Non-Union Staff and Council  
**Prepared by:** Sarah Traynor, Manager of Human Resources

---

### A. Recommendations

---

THAT Council receive Staff Report FAF.24.065, entitled “Market and Pay Equity Review for Non-Union Staff and Council” and accompanying presentation from Jane Mizanski, Senior Consultant with Gallagher Benefit Services (Canada) Group Inc. for information purposes;

AND THAT Council review the comparators listed within the attached presentation for consideration and approval.

### B. Overview

---

This staff report provides an update to Council on the Market and Pay Equity Review for Non-Union Staff and Council project, approved in the 2024 budget. Included with the staff report is a presentation by Jane Mizanski, Senior Consultant with Gallagher Benefit Services Group (Canada) Inc. (“Gallagher”), outlining the project's objectives, approach, and timeline.

### C. Background

---

The Town’s Compensation Administration Program is designed to ensure reasonable, consistently applied, internally equitable and externally competitive pay practices that will attract, retain, reward, and motivate quality employees. Being a preferred employer is integral when competing for talent. It is necessary for both attracting new hires to the organization and retaining the Town’s existing workforce.

Competitive pay is determined by surveying comparable municipal organizations and assessing general trends within the labour market. Following the Town’s Compensation Administration Policy, [POL.COR.23.01](#), a market review of the non-union salary grid is undertaken every four (4) years in the second year of the Term of Council and considered through the budget process for implementation in the third year of Council. This periodic review is essential to ensure that the Town’s compensation packages remain relevant and competitive in an evolving employment landscape.

The Town currently has a contract with Gallagher for compensation administration consulting

services. The last market and pay equity review for non-union staff was completed by Gallagher in 2021.

In 2021, Council established an independent Council Compensation Committee to review and make recommendations to Council on compensation for Members of the Council. Through the 2024 budget, Council approved that a Council compensation review, including base remuneration, benefits, pension, per diems and allowances, be included as part of the Market & Pay Equity Review to be completed by Gallagher. The Council Compensation review will also include a review of the Committee of Adjustment remuneration.

## **D. Analysis**

---

The Market and Pay Equity Review for Non-Union Staff and Council project will involve the evaluation of approximately 125 staff positions, including Library roles, and 3 elected officials' positions. The consultant will conduct a custom market study that will initially involve reviewing the comparator organizations used in the 2021 market assessment to ensure they remain relevant, considering factors such as size, growth, and geographical proximity. Once the comparator group is confirmed by Council, a survey questionnaire will then be developed to gather relevant data for assessing Council remuneration and expense practices, including soliciting salary and organizational information from the selected comparators.

### **Non-Union Staff Market and Pay Equity Review**

A comprehensive job-matching process will be conducted, an updated salary grid will be formulated to align job rates with the market, and a pay equity compliance assessment will be carried out, ensuring adherence to the Pay Equity Act for the non-union employee group. The final deliverable will be a summary report for non-union staff positions, complete with recommendations to ensure the Town continues to be competitive and equitable.

### **Council Compensation Review**

For Council members, a survey questionnaire will be designed to collect feedback and input concerning Council member duties, time commitments, remuneration methods (base, per diems, etc.), and other pertinent issues.

Additionally, the results of the Council market survey will be summarized, and a report will be provided, outlining observations regarding Council's base remuneration, per diems, and related expense policies and practices compared to those of similar-sized municipal organizations.

The Consultant will prepare a final report with recommendations for Council's consideration to modify remuneration policy, ensuring that pay and expenses reflect and balance the need to pay fairly for the roles while mindful of the ability to pay and public perceptions of these positions.

At the April 29, 2024, Committee of the Whole meeting, Jane Mizanski, Senior Consultant with Gallagher, will be presenting an overview of the Market and Pay Equity Review for Non-Union Employees and Council, including the project objectives,

approach, and timeline.

## **E. Strategic Priorities**

---

### **1. Communication and Engagement**

We will enhance communications and engagement between Town Staff, Town residents and stakeholders.

### **2. Organizational Excellence**

We will continually seek out ways to improve the internal organization of Town Staff and the management of Town assets.

## **F. Environmental Impacts**

---

None.

## **G. Financial Impacts**

---

This project was budgeted under the Corporate Administration - 2024 Studies and Plans in the amount of \$60,000.

A final report, including recommendations related to internal equity, pay equity compliance, market competitiveness and the associated budget implications will be provided to Council for consideration.

## **H. In Consultation With**

---

Senior Management Team

Human Resources Staff

## **I. Public Engagement**

---

The topic of this Staff Report has not been the subject of a Public Meeting and/or a Public Information Centre as neither a Public Meeting nor a Public Information Centre are required. However, any comments regarding this report should be submitted to Sarah Traynor, Manager of Human Resources [hr@thebluemountains.ca](mailto:hr@thebluemountains.ca).

## **J. Attached**

---

1. TBM Market and Pay Equity Review Presentation

Respectfully submitted,

Sarah Traynor  
Manager of Human Resources

Shawn Everitt  
Chief Administrative Officer

For more information, please contact:  
Sarah Traynor, Manager of Human Resources  
[hr@thebluemountains.ca](mailto:hr@thebluemountains.ca)  
519-599-3131 extension 244

### Report Approval Details

Document Title:	FAF.24.065 Market and Pay Equity Review for Non-Union Staff and Council.docx
Attachments:	- Attachment-1-TBM-Market-and-Pay-Equity-Review-Presentation.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Apr 20, 2024

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

**Sarah Traynor - Apr 19, 2024 - 4:19 PM**

**Shawn Everitt - Apr 20, 2024 - 8:11 AM**



# Town of The Blue Mountains 2024 Staff Compensation & Council Remuneration Reviews

*April 2024*



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Agenda

**1** Introduction – Staff Compensation & Council Remuneration

**2** Staff Compensation Review – Background, Approach and Methodology

**3** Council Remuneration – Background, Scope, Approach

**4** Project Timelines

# Introduction

Gallagher was retained to assist the Town of The Blue Mountains with a review of:

- Salaries and wages for the non-union employee group to ensure the Town is competitive while meeting pay equity compliance requirements
- Remuneration policies and practices for Elected Officials of Town Council to ensure they are fair and equitable

# Staff Compensation Review – salaries and wages



# Background to the Assignment

- The last market assessment for competitiveness completed in 2021 that included full review of the entire compensation program:
  - Job descriptions updated, evaluations using new JE tool, market assessment and pay equity compliance
  - Produced a market competitive grid aligned to the market median/50<sup>th</sup> percentile pay policy
- New/changed jobs have been evaluated and incorporated into the current salary structure
- Job descriptions are regularly reviewed and kept up-to-date as a best practice
- Compensation policy commits to full market review every 4 years

# Background to the Assignment

- Annual across the board adjustments applied to the grid to maintain market position BUT has been a volatile and changing marketplace
  - Inflation wide range of change - 0.1% to +8%
  - Aggressive competition for talent particularly for municipal specific roles
  - Changes to the workplace – hybrid/remote work locations shifted the conversations on pay
  - Comparators do not all apply the same COLA using same criteria impacting job rates
- Town continues to have challenges with retention and attraction, and pay is a consideration
  - Recognize pay is not the whole package but is the first consideration for candidates and important to not discourage applicants at the start of the process

# Components of Compensation Policy

- Fairness
  - Job rates based on the value of jobs as determined through job evaluation of current and actual qualifications and responsibilities; provides relative value of a job within an employee group
- Compliance
  - Based on analysis of job rates for female jobs relative to similar value male jobs in an employee group to achieve compliance
- Competitiveness
  - Address attraction and retention issues, achieved by paying at a competitive percentile of a defined pay market
- Affordability
  - Determined by Council having regard to budget

# External Market Review

- Selecting comparators is important to credibility of the review with intent to reflect ‘the marketplace’ as best as possible
- Selection giving consideration to municipal organizations:
  - Comparable size – population served, operating \$, employee head count
  - Population growth
  - Similar employment markets
  - Equivalent scope of services including water/wastewater
  - Seasonal influx
  - Municipalities with market competitive compensation programs
  - Historical comparators
- Job matching will be based on qualifications and scope of responsibilities, not titles

## Recommended Comparators (13)

- ✓ Barrie
- ✓ Caledon
- ✓ Georgina
- ✓ Muskoka Lakes
- ✓ Niagara-on-the-Lake
- ✓ Springwater
- ✓ Grey County
- ✓ Collingwood
- ✓ East Gwillimbury
- ✓ Innisfil
- ✓ New Tecumseth
- ✓ Saugeen Shores
- ✓ Simcoe County

# Council Remuneration Review

# Project Scope

- Gallagher was retained to undertake a review to ensure elected officials are fairly compensated relative to comparator organizations and considers:
  - Compensation that reflects their roles and responsibilities
  - Recognizes the time commitments for preparing, attending council and committee meetings, participating in other Council business, and responding to constituents
  - Is fair and reasonable to attract a diverse pool of candidates reflective of the communities they serve
  - Is within a remuneration framework that is financially sustainable and reasonable given current practices for municipal council remuneration across the province

## Approach / Methodology

- **Consultation** with elected officials to gather feedback on e.g. remuneration, salary administration, expenses and eligibility criteria for reimbursements
- Comparator **Survey Questionnaire** regarding base remuneration, per diems, travel and expense policies, attendance requirements, access to benefits and pension, salary administration practices to maintain compensation levels
  - Additional – compensation to public members specific to the Committee of Adjustment
- Collate comparator responses to identify where the Town is a leader, comparable, or lagging relative to the comparator practices, and to inform recommendations for consideration



# Comparators for Council Remuneration

- Considerations in selecting comparators:
  - Comparable size as indicated by population served, households, and taxation
  - Geography and composition such as urban/rural, seasonal influx, and tourism impacts on municipal services
  - Growth that impacts on diversity and complexity of issues before Council
  - Historical comparators for some continuity
  - Public perception – credibility of the comparators influences the acceptance of recommendations
- Ideally should mirror the comparators for staff review but differences are necessary and appropriate
  - Looking for comparable not competitive
  - Staff comparators can cross lower, upper and single tier

# Comparator Review

Municipality	Population	Taxation - Own Purposes	F/time E'es	Stats Canada Population Growth %	Land Sq Km	Pop Density	2021 Council Review	2024 Council Review
Muskoka Lakes Township	6,588	\$13,224,649	90	16	774	10	YES	YES
<b>The Blue Mountains</b>	<b>8,794</b>	<b>\$19,237,898</b>	<b>142</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>285</b>	<b>33</b>		
Penetanguishene	10,077	\$11,995,499	54	12	25	396	YES	NO
Grey Highlands	10,424	\$11,900,224	68	6	879	12	YES	YES
Meaford	11,485	\$15,878,312	83	5	588	20	YES	YES
Tiny	12,966	\$16,961,873	69	34	335	39	NO	YES
Gravenhurst	13,157	\$17,545,404	93	7	489	27	YES	YES
Clearview	14,814	\$18,151,147	69	5	556	27	YES	YES
Saugeen Shores	15,908	\$19,298,101	115	16	170	94	YES	YES
Midland	17,817	\$24,049,692	134	6	35	504	YES	YES
Niagara-on-the-Lake	19,088	\$14,826,995	99	9	131	145	YES	YES
Huntsville	21,147	\$18,145,085	133	7	705	30	YES	YES
Owen Sound	21,612	\$31,952,941	236	1	24	893	YES	YES
Collingwood	24,811	\$38,464,174	202	14	33	748	YES	YES
Wasaga Beach	24,862	\$28,365,808	166	20	57	433	YES	YES
Orangeville	30,338	\$38,033,901	154	4	15	1990	YES	NO
Orillia City	33,411	\$63,470,882	290	7	29	1171	YES	NO
East Gwillimbury Town	37,665	\$28,271,104	177	44	245	141	YES	NO
Bradford West Gwillimbury	40,251	\$41,831,017	217	21	201	214	YES	YES
New Tecumseth	43,948	\$40,493,726	214	28	274	161	YES	YES
Innisfil	44,099	\$53,137,238	250.23	19	262	165	YES	YES
Georgina Township	49,992	\$49,469,336	308	5	288	166	NO	YES

<b>Recommended Comparators - 2024</b>		<b>2021 Review</b>	<b>2024 Review</b>
1	Bradford West Gwillimbury	Y	Y
2	Clearview	Y	Y
3	Collingwood	Y	Y
4	Georgina	NO	Y
5	Gravenhurst <b>OR</b> Huntsville <b>OR</b> Muskoka Lakes	Y x 3	CHANGE
6	Grey Highlands	Y	Y
7	Innisfil	Y	Y
8	Meaford	Y	Y
9	Midland	Y	Y
10	New Tecumseth	Y	Y
11	Niagara-on-the-Lake	Y	Y
12	Owen Sound	Y	Y
13	Saugeen Shores	Y	Y
14	Tiny	NO	Y
15	Wasaga Beach	Y	Y
<b>Removed from List</b>			
	East Gwillimbury Town	Y	NO
	Orangeville	Y	NO
	Orillia City	Y	NO
	Penetanguishene	Y	NO

## Next Steps

- Council to review and confirm comparators
- Options for Council consultation:
  - Deploy a questionnaire to each member of council
  - 1-1 interviews
  - 1 or 2 group discussions
- Consultant will deploy Council Survey Questionnaire/solicit for salary data for staff positions - May
  - Collate responses, review preliminary results with Project Lead – June
  - Implementation costing, draft report - June
  - Report and presentation to Council - July



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

**Jane Mizanski**

Senior Consultant

Jane\_Mizanski@ajg.com

647-407-5256

181 University Avenue

Toronto, ON M5H 3M7

Canada

Consulting and insurance brokerage services to be provided by Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. and/or its affiliate Gallagher Benefit Services (Canada) Group Inc. Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc., a non-investment firm and subsidiary of Arthur J. Gallagher & Co., is a licensed insurance agency that does business in California as "Gallagher Benefit Services of California Insurance Services" and in Massachusetts as "Gallagher Benefit Insurance Services." Investment advisory services and corresponding named fiduciary services may be offered through Gallagher Fiduciary Advisors, LLC, a Registered Investment Adviser. Gallagher Fiduciary Advisors, LLC is a single-member, limited-liability company, with Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. as its single member. Certain appropriately licensed individuals of Arthur J. Gallagher & Co. subsidiaries or affiliates, excluding Gallagher Fiduciary Advisors, LLC, offer securities through Kestra Investment Services (Kestra IS), member FINRA/SIPC and or investment advisory services through Kestra Advisory Services (Kestra AS), an affiliate of Kestra IS. Neither Kestra IS nor Kestra AS is affiliated with Arthur J. Gallagher & Co., Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. or Gallagher Fiduciary Advisors, LLC. Neither Kestra AS, Kestra IS, Arthur J. Gallagher & Co., nor their affiliates provide accounting, legal, or tax advice.